multEE
facilitating multi-level governance
for Energy Efficiency

Synthesis report on Country Workshops

This project has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No 649829.

Authors

Tyge Kjaer and Jan Andersen, RUC

Elisabeth Böck , AEA

Minas Iatridis and Christos Tourkolias, CRES

Ivars Kudrenickis, Gaidis Klavs and Janis Rekis, IPE

Marko Matosović, Mia Dragović, and Nikola Karadža, EIHP

Marc Ringel, Nuertingen Geislingen University

Romualdas Skema and Sigitas Masaitis, LEI

Konstantin Dimitrov and Sashe Panevski, MACEF

Eduard Jambor and Michal Nemeth, SIEA

Benjamin Struss, GIZ

Document title	Development of concrete proposals for multilevel governance coordination
Work Package	WP3
Document Type	Deliverable
Date	30 August 2017
Document Status	Final

Acknowledgements & Disclaimer

This project has received funding from the *European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme* under grant agreement No 649829.

Table of Contents

List of abbreviations

AEA	Austrian Energy Agency
CM	Coordination Mechanism
CRES	Center for Renewable Energy Sources ad Savings
EE	Energy Efficiency
EEAP	Energy Efficiency Action Plan
EED	Energy Efficiency Directive
EEOS	Energy Efficiency Obligation Scheme
EPC	Energy Performance Certificate
ESCO	Energy Service Company
ESD	Energy Service Directive
ETS	Energy Trading System
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH
IPE	Institute of Physical Energetics
LEI	Lithuanian Energy Institute
M&V	Monitoring and Verification
MACEF	Macedonian Center for Energy Efficiency
NEEAP	National Energy Efficiency Action Plan
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
R&D	Research and Development
RES	Renewable Energy Systems
RUC	University of Roskilde
SEAP	Sustainable Energy Action Plan
SIEA	Slovak Innovation and Energy Agency
SME	Small and Medium Enterprises
SMIV	System for Monitoring, Measurement, Verification of Energy Savings
SWOT	Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats
TD	Top Down
VC	Vertical Coordination

I Introduction

As an element in the MultEE project country workshops have been carried out for giving input to Deliverable 3.2 – Development of concrete proposals for multilevel governance coordination.

The actual deliverable 3.2 – Synthesis report on Country Workshops includes an extract from the presentations and discussions at the national workshops for developing country specific proposals for multilevel coordination.

The report contains key elements from the workshops divided on the following subjects:

- Energy policy
- Data
- Vertical coordination
- Horizontal coordination
- Capacity

The report has also been used to giving input Deliverable 3.2 – Development of concrete proposals for multilevel governance coordination.

I.I Energy Policy

Croatia

The Croatian legislature has defined the obligations of cities, towns, and counties to write and implement Sustainable Energy Action Plans (SEAPs).

Austria

- On local level, 373 of Austria's 2,100 municipalities have voluntarily prepared their own strategy on energy efficiency within the framework of energy efficiency programs like "e5 – program for energy efficient municipalities", "Energy-saving Municipalities program" or the Covenant of Mayors.
- Austria's federal provinces support the federal government in its obligation to report alternative measures. This agreement, however, is on a voluntary basis. The measures reported by the federal provinces mostly include the results of subsidy programs administrated by them like for example the Residential Building Support.

- At the regional level, the governments of the nine federal provinces have prepared their own energy strategies. The timeframe for those energy strategies varies between 2020 and 2050. The targets set in them are often more ambitious than the ones set in the national energy strategy.

Latvia

The Latvia cumulative energy savings for the year 2020, calculated and notified according to the Article 7 of the EED, is 9896 GWh. The dominating part of these savings shall be reached by the alternative measures. The responsible ministry for half of these measures are the Ministry of Economics.

Fyr of Macedonia

- 75% of the participants in the workshop suggest using an alternative system to an energy efficiency obligation system.
- The suggestions were equally distributed between the following measures:
  - Energy or CO2 taxes
  - Financing schemes and instruments or fiscal incentives
  - Regulations or voluntary agreements
  - Standards and norms improving the energy efficiency of products and services
  - Energy labelling schemes
  - Training and Education, including energy advisory programs (Capacity)

Greece

In Greece the most effective options so as to facilitate the establishment of coordination mechanisms comprise the development of a national central strategy for energy savings that should be prepared as an initiative induced by the regional authorities, the organization of specific consultation rounds for the efficient identification of the needs and priorities and the demonstration of best practices and pilot projects.

Lithuania

The legal responsibility in Lithuania for energy efficiency policy making lies at national level. The ministries, which have the legal competence for energy efficiency policy formulation, consist of the Ministry of Energy, the Ministry of Environment and the Ministry of Economy.

Slovakia

- In Slovakia energy efficiency policy is basically set by Energy Policy of the Slovak Republic, the latest from October 2014, covering the period until 2035. Energy Efficiency Strategy was adopted by the Government Resolution No. 576 of 04. 07. 2007, supported by the report in 2011, based on ESD, where three-years Energy Efficiency Action Plans have been used as implementing mechanisms for this strategy. Energy Efficiency

Action Plans aim to propose energy efficiency measures to ensure the fulfilment of the policy and strategy objectives.
- In Slovakia the used data collection system (MSEE) cannot be used for evaluation of energy efficiency measures from the NEEAP or Annual report or for the purposes of evaluation of progress towards the targets.

Denmark

Denmark wishes to fulfill the obligations of Article 7 by means of energy efficiency obligations. Such obligations have existed in Denmark since 2006. They are contained in the energy-policy agreement of 22 March 2012 about energy savings by the energy companies in Denmark. The agreement will remain in force up to 2020. It is necessary that the stakeholders can obtain more profit by implementing energy efficiency projects.

I.II Data

Croatia

- Implementation of possibilities for the inclusion of the results of SMiV in the future SECAPs (Sustainable Energy and Climate Action Plans).
- Necessary information and data on energy savings are being sent on a regular basis, at the right time and in complete form.
- 10,000 energy savings measures which were inserted into SMiV.
- The total energy savings monitored and verified by SMiV in 2016 were above 1 PJ.
- It was expected that the upgrade of SMiV will be finalised 10-15 days after the conclusion of the workshop.
- SECAPs would follow the results of SMiV for the calculation of energy savings and their correlation with the implementation of renewable energy in Croatia. The integration of these results can be compared with future energy savings.
- A combination and merge of SMiV and ISGE (Energy Management Information System).

Austria

- The Austrian MVP system is used for collecting the data of all implemented energy efficiency measures. The federal government, the federal provinces and energy retail sales companies report their implemented measures using either standardized calculation formulas or entering the energy savings of the measure and information on how they were calculated.
- However, the Austrian MVP system is designed as a tool for data collection and evaluation only. Results from the reports on the entered energy efficiency measures can be used for the drafting of new energy strategies or policies, the system itself does not offer technical assistance for the planning of future savings.

- Municipalities expressed the wish to be able to enter and bank (in an banking system) their implemented energy efficiency measures in the Austrian MVP too in order to have more time to find a financially reasonable offer for them.
- Legal uncertainties about ownership of energy efficiency measures could give problems with double counting. A specification by law is needed.

Greece

- In Greece there is a lack of a homogeneous measurement and monitoring framework according to the requirements of the EED for the achieved energy savings. They use different indicators and data resources.
- In Greece the developed Action Plans within the framework of Covenant of Mayors can be considered as an effective tool so as to collect the required data for the estimation of the energy consumption's current status, they can be utilized as tools for the assessment of the realized energy efficiency measures and the calculation of the achieved energy savings.
- In Greece it is therefore crucial to introduce unified measurement and monitoring protocols, which will be followed by all the responsible authorities.

Lithuania

- In Lithuania the "bottom-up" method is used to establish energy savings due to each individual measure implemented. Energy savings of individual measures can be evaluated using measurement-based data:
  - directly metering the energy consumption at the entity where the measure is implemented (a specific technological installation, process, a building's heating system, lighting equipment, etc.);
  - data of energy bills for a specific period submitted by energy companies before and after implementing the measure;
  - energy sales data of energy companies collected before and after implementing the measure;
  - equipment and devices sales data;
  - data of applied research and surveys.
  - For calculations are using data collected by Statistics of Lithuania and other national data.
- In Lithuania the Implementation and usage of IT systems, developed in multEE project, can be an essential part of the coordination mechanisms in Lithuania, facilitating the exchange of information, fostering the engagement of the national and local stakeholders and improving the monitoring of the energy efficiency measures both vertically and horizontally.

Slovakia

In Slovakia exists and is implemented M&V scheme for energy efficiency measures, called Monitoring system on energy efficiency, which is governed by the Act No. 321/2014 Coll. (New Energy Efficiency Act).

I.III Vertical coordination

Croatia

- There is an advanced level of networking going on between local and national institutional levels regarding energy saving measures.
- Since logistics and coordination mechanisms in cities, towns and counties are already in place. So no improvements in this field are mentioned.

Austria

- Formal coordination mechanisms neither exist on vertical nor on horizontal level. Involvement of another governance level (e.g. the federal level involving the regional level or the regional level involving the local level) in energy policy formulation mostly happens on an informal basis, usually with no obligation of mutual coordination.
- For the implementation of the ESD, a so-called "15a agreement" was concluded. It is an agreement between the federal government and the provincial governments about matters falling within the sphere of competence of the federal provinces. Such an agreement could also be conducted by the EED directive.
- The agreement should contain a guideline for the calculation of energy savings. (Data)

Latvia

- Coordination mechanisms shall be improved for identification and inclusion of new AM within the Alternative Measures Plan.
- Motivation to implement Energy Management Systems and Plans.
- Cooperation with Advisory Boards, Associations and NGO. A new initiative should be developed further.
- There is no regional administrative level in Latvia.
- Energy Efficiency Improvements within Covenant of Mayors (COM) Plans: evaluation of plans.

Fyr of Macedonia

- In Fyr of Macedonia the following recommendations were given:
  - Defining working groups, coordination should be governed by rules and institutions
  - Introducing MVP system, change the bylaws (bottom up)
  - Improving the legal framework
  - Definition of obligations
  - Helping tools
  - Formation of questionnaires and statistics for more parties
  - Coordinating body with more powers
  - Development of guidelines
  - Defining responsible ministry

Greece

- In Greece there is no integrated coordination mechanism.
- In Greece the vertical coordination can be benefited by the adoption of effective regulations and the design of flexible financial schemes and mechanisms ensuring the active involvement of all the administrative parties.

Lithuania

- In Lithuania the distribution of responsibilities for energy efficiency policy making and implementation is clearly defined among the different governmental layers. Generally, there is a consensus about the distributed responsibilities incorporating various overlaying and jurisdiction issues.
- There is no regional energy legislation in Lithuania.
- At local level in Lithuania the municipalities have the right to elaborate the local energy plans. In Lithuania there are 60 municipalities. The main instruments for horizontal coordination between municipalities are legal obligation for preparation of various local energy plans.
- In Lithuania the participants of the workshop agrees that coordination mechanisms are essential for the effective preparation and implementation of energy efficiency measures and the achievement of the corresponding imposed targets.
- In Lithuania the New Energy Efficiency Law (adopted 03 November 2016) will be very useful for development of existing coordination mechanisms.

Slovakia

In Slovakia Strengthening of the vertical and horizontal coordination is needed. The quality of the vertical and horizontal communication flow with regard to EE policy making and implementation at the national, regional and local level, can be characterised as good, but it could be improved at all levels.

Denmark

- The web information site: Energispareindsatsen.dk could be improved to give better information to the final energy consumers.
- Also the Danish Energy Agency could give better information.
- A market place for not reported energy savings could be established to secure that the companies better could reach their individual targets of energy saving.
- The priority factor could be increased for projects with higher additionality e.g. projects including consultancy.
- A central reporting system for energy savings could be established to reduce double counting of the energy savings.

I.IV Horizontal coordination

Austria

- On regional level a nationwide cooperation forum on climate and energy between the provinces and the Austrian Energy Agency exists.
- Many energy policy-related topics are under the legal competence of the federal provinces in order to be able to address the regional particularities. This includes for example the definition of minimum standards for the granting of subsidies or the building codes. However, this results in nine different approaches on energy strategies. In order to coordinate the savings of all provinces and to benefit the most from the regional particularities, horizontal coordination between the federal provinces should be improved by periodic coordination meetings.

Latvia

- Horizontal cooperation between responsible authorities shall promote effective procedures for energy savings monitoring in investment support programmes (ISP), taking into account the share of ISP within the set of AM.
- The important issue is the effective internal cooperation between the structures of Ministry of Economics (namely, the Energy Efficiency Division and divisions responsible for EU Funds programs).
- The motivation of large companies/large electricity consumers, which are obliged to implement EMS, to elaborate high quality energy efficiency improvement plan, should be further promoted.
- No Energy Agency in Latvia.
- Improvement of coordination: definition of Energy Efficiency as the horizontal target of national operational programs
- Improvement of coordination within the implementation of State budget programs - green investment schemes.

Fyr of Macedonia

- In Fyr of Macedonia the following recommendations were given:
  - Working groups that will meet periodically
  - Appointment of persons from each institution to work on energy and raising their capacity.
  - Preparation of action plans for each institution.
  - Changing the legal framework for budgeting and allocation of energy costs as a separate item.
  - Establishment of an official body for coordination
  - Greater involvement of regions
  - Perform a regular training
  - Regular information sessions
  - System Interface / training for employees at all levels

Greece

In Greece the horizontal coordination can be improved through the constitution of formal working groups with the participation of representatives from all the involved ministries accompanied by the adoption of specific legislation regarding their obligations and roles.

Denmark

In Denmark the horizontal coordination should be improved.

I.IV.I Evaluation of mechanisms'' effectiveness for the development of a coordination mechanism

Mechanisms	Very Low	Low	Medium	High	Very high
Establishment of official coordination bodies	0%	5%	35%	30%	30%
Establishment of unofficial bodies and networks	25%	25%	35%	15%	0%
Memorandum of cooperation	5%	15%	35%	35%	10%
Adoption of regulatory measures	5%	0%	20%	35%	40%
Design of financial mechanisms	5%	5%	16%	42%	32%
Establishment of official working groups	0%	11%	32%	42%	16%
Organization of consultation procedures	5%	30%	20%	40%	5%
Obligatory development of regional and local plans	0%	0%	30%	45%	25%
Technical assistance schemes	0%	0%	25%	40%	35%
Monitoring & evaluation IT tools	0%	0%	15%	60%	25%

Lithuania

In Lithuania existing horizontal coordination mechanisms for local administrative levels requires updating, more involving of local actors, stakeholders from research, business or civil society into policy formulation and implementation. Existing legal obligations for financial support schemes (for example for ESCO's) must be updated.

I.V Capacity

Through education programmes and job specializations, the know-how has been established at a local level, thus allowing the employees at the local level to be educationally qualified for the monitoring of energy savings.

I.V.I Evaluation of aspects' necessity for enhancement

Aspect	Very Low	Low	Medium	High	Very high
Access on data and information	0%	0%	0%	45%	55%
Level of skills	0%	10%	0%	60%	30%
Level of knowledge	0%	5%	10%	40%	45%
Availability of tools	0%	0%	15%	40%	45%
Availability of resources	5%	5%	0%	30%	60%

Greece

- Due to the lack of the required personnel in Greece, it is important to design specific programs for the replication of the best practices. Towards this direction the constitution of a coordination body may be crucial for the most effective promotion and replication of the best practices and pilot projects.
- Regarding the lack of technical resources in Greece, it is proposed to provide the required flexibility and the necessary budget to the regional and local authorities so as to hire external consultants obtaining indirectly the required technical expertise.

Lithuania

In Lithuania existing educational programs for energy efficiency at local level must be developed.

Denmark

A lot of training has been carried out in Denmark – especially in relation to the municipalities, and this training should be continued and improved.

multEE

facilitating multi-level governance for Energy Efficiency

german cooperation
DEUTSCHE ZUSAMMENARBEIT

Implemented by:
giz Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

UNIVERSITAS ROSKILDENSIS • IN TRANQUILLO MORS • IN FLUCTU VITA

eco logic

AUSTRIAN ENERGY AGENCY

EIHP

MACEF
Macedonian Center for Energy Efficiency

SIEA

КАПЕ
CRES

www.multEE.eu